

HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION AGENDA

August 15, 2019 4:00 p.m.

111 North Front Street, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next hearing. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-8871, or email zdjones@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, September 12, 2019 111 North Front Street, 3rd Floor, Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING 4:00 p.m., Thursday, September 19, 2019 111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- **VI.** APPROVAL OF MINUTES Thursday, July 29, 2019.
- VII. APPROVAL OF STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

NEW APPLICATIONS

1. HR-19-08-009 (not required to attend)

736 Bedford Avenue

Fannie R. Nesbit (Applicant/Owner)

- MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL
- **2. HR-19-08-010** (not required to attend)

972 East Capital Street

Broad Street Living, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

Old Oaks Historic District

18th & E. Broad Street Historic District

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:05 P.M.

3. HR-19-08-011 (attending)

596-598 South Ohio Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Broad Street Living, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

This is an ongoing rehabilitation project of a vacant, two-family dwelling. General repairs and new windows were approved in February/March 2019. An application, photos, and elevation drawings have been submitted. New Garage

- Build a new, frame, 35' wide x 24' deep, three-car garage in the rear yard, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be smooth, 4" HardieBoard siding with wood trim.
- Asphalt roofing shingles to be Owens Corning, standard 3-tab, "Estate Gray."
- All trim (corner boards, door trim, frieze) to be per the Columbus Register of Historic Properties guidelines (page 85) for Garages and Outbuildings.
- Overhang to be 12" on all elevations.
- Three overhead carriage-style doors on east elevation to be per the submitted product cut sheet.

Build New Dormer

• Build a new dormer, to provide egress, on the south elevation.

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

4. HR-19-07-015 (not attending)

394 East Town Street

East Town Street Historic District

394 East Town Street, LLC./Kyle G. Davis (Owner)

This application was continued from the June 20, 2019 HRC hearing. <u>Applicant requests to be continued to the September 19, 2019 HRC hearing.</u>

New Pull-In Parking Area

- Expand the existing, brick parking area along Selina Alley, to create two (2) new, pull-in spaces, per the submitted rendering and site plan.
- Remove existing stone curbing to create new, 62' wide curb cut.
- Remove existing wrought iron fence.
- Install new Hollandstone, Rustic Red pavers, per submitted product cut sheet.

New Parallel Parking Area

- Create two (2) new, off-street, parallel parking spaces along Selina Alley, per the submitted site plan.
- Remove existing stone curbing to create new, 44' wide curb cut.
- Relocate existing wrought iron fence to west side of new parking spaces.
- Install new Hollandstone, Rustic Red pavers, per submitted product cut sheet.
- All existing trees to remain.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:20 P.M.

5. HR-19-07-016 (attending)

662-664 South Champion Avenue **Aaron McDaniel (Applicant)**

Old Oaks Historic District Redwood Investment Group, LLC. (Owner)

This application was continued from the June 20, 2019 HRC hearing. Work was completed by a previous owner that is not in compliance with the Certificate of Appropriateness. Replacement of all windows was approved 12-13-2017. Repair of mineral fiber siding, replacement of concrete driveway and new concrete porch floor were approved 12-12-2017. Installation of new windows and construction of a new rear porch at 662 S Champion Ave, has been moved to staff approval.

Front Porch / 664

• Front porch rebuilt by previous owner, including new roof, ceiling, fiberglass columns, and removal of horizontal railings.

Tower / 664

- Complete exploratory removal of LP Smartside siding and trim on the tower, where original shingles, dentils, and other trim were to be retained or replaced in-like-kind, per COA18-10-15.
- New trim has been removed to reveal that the original trim was removed.

New Asphalt Shingles / 664 and 662

- New, non-compliant asphalt shingles were installed on both houses by previous owner.
- The shingle is the Atlas StormMaster Shake, "Pewter" color.

Asphalt Driveway

- New concrete driveway was approved, per COA#17-12-10a. New asphalt drive was installed by previous owner. New Doors
- Retain all new doors on both houses, as installed by current owners.
- **6. HR-19-07-020** (not attending)

683 Linwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Jennifer Mutrux and Daniel Linden (Owners)

APPLICATION REMOVED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:45 P.M.

7. **HR-19-07-021** (attending)

530 East Rich Street

East Town Street Historic District

Schiff Capital /Michael Shannon, attny. (Applicant) Choices for Victims of Domestic Violence, Inc. An application, photos, and site plan have been submitted. Sanborns indicate the concrete block, rear addition and garage (historically 526) date between 1921 and 1951. Some additions (historically 532) may date to 1901 or earlier.

Site visit has not been conducted. Number of units in the new construction has been increased from 30 to 42 units.

Demolition

- Demolish rear, concrete block addition and garage (526).
- Demolish rear, brick sections of both buildings (526 & 532).

New Construction

- Construct new, rear, three-story addition to include fourteen (14) 650 sf units per floor (total 42 units).
- Additional discussion and consideration of 3-story building to include green space on the rooftop with massing and height to compliment existing East Town Street Historic District streetscape.

Renovation

- Renovate existing buildings, to include two (2) units per floor, per building (8 total units).
- Development to include 38 parking spaces.

The following is from the July 29 HRC hearing:

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner McCabe:

- Asked for clarification regarding what period of significance the Applicants are focusing on in regard to preservation of historic fabric. Is protection of the two original houses the goal? There are other pieces that may be additions, but are at least fifty years old.
- We need to truly understand the original footprint of each historic house and what pieces are additions.
- The Commission may struggle with where the line should be for removal of any historic additions on the two houses because we don't know the overall design yet.

Commissioner Barton:

- What is the story of the property? What's the story the preserved part will tell? It may tell a story of wealth, but an institutional part came after that.
- The design of any addition will need to consider the character of the two existing houses. It should not be hulking over the historic houses.
- The Commission values density, but it cannot look like we've plopped a giant rectangle right up behind historic residential homes.
- Agrees that retaining the historic sections of the houses for connectors is the best way to go.

Commissioner Morgan:

- The challenge of this project is similar to the other project (602 E. Town Street). How is it going to look? How can you add a massive addition onto two historic houses, that doesn't just look like it's eating two historic houses? The end result must be something appropriate.
- The next review should include some sketches showing the elevations and overall massing and how it will fit with this historic property and the surrounding neighborhood.
- The Applicants should study the City Code for Exterior Building Alterations, Demolition and Infill Construction (3116.11, 3116.14 & 3116.12).
- Consider that the historic sections of the two houses that are proposed for demolition could be retained as connectors to new a bigger mass. Those areas could be utilized as courtyard.

Commissioner Henry:

- In order to figure out what the massing will be like, we need to understand the extent of demolition. Chairperson Henry referred visually to each section of the buildings, and asked the Commissioners for general input regarding impressions of significance and integrity. Preliminary input was provided as follows:
 - The concrete block addition behind 526 E Rich St does not have significance or retain integrity.
 - The brick garage behind 526 E. Rich St, built between 1921 and 1951, that replaced a carriage house need to understand the overall project before determining whether a ca 1930s associated with a historic house could be approved for demolition. The building has been highly altered on the interior.
 - The concrete block garage behind 532 E. Rich St, built after 1951- The building has been highly altered.
 - The houses at 526 E. Rich Street and 532 E. Rich Street Still need to consider the overall site plan, floor plans, etc. for any additions before removal of any additions can be considered.
- It's going to be a tough sell to tear those historic sections down unless the addition is something spectacular.

STAFF APPROVALS

• HR-19-08-001

702 Oakwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Moshe Mizrachi (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-08-001, 702 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete, public and service sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the same locations and of the same dimensions, as needed.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as needed, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

Install New Concrete Steps

- Remove the deteriorated, concrete front porch and service steps, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete steps in the same location and of the same dimension.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

Remove Existing Driveway and Install New Driveway

- Remove the existing, deteriorated concrete/asphalt parking pad in the rear yard, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install a new, concrete apron and parking pad in the same location, per the submitted site plan.

New Patio

- Install a new brick paver patio in the rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
- New, 14' x 10' patio at the rear of the house, utilizing salvaged brick pavers, per submitted photographs and site plan.
- All pavers to be installed in a manner to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.

• HR-19-08-002

27 East Oakland Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

Color:

Richard Chapman (Applicant/Owner)

Manufacturer:

Approve Application HR-19-08-002, 27 East Oakland Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof / Garage

- Remove all slate on the garage roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be:

Style:

[] GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	[] English Gray Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Note: Slate roof was removed and new asphalt shingles partially installed prior to review and approval. The slate is not salvageable. The installed asphalt shingles are from the approved roofing shingles list.

• HR-19-08-003

615 Oakwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Asad Brown (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-08-003, 615 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations, as needed, with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. <u>Make any/all necessary</u> repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and

neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Repair/Replace Asphalt Shingles & Flashing

• Replace any/all missing or deteriorated asphalt shingles and flashing on the main roof and porch roof, as needed, per the submitted photographs.

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm).

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Siding Repair/Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood siding and wood trim elements, as needed. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.</u>
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.

Repair Rear Deck

- Replace any missing or deteriorated wood flooring on the existing rear deck, as needed.
- Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.

HR-19-08-004

4783 Olentangy Blvd.

Old Beechwold Historic District

Robert Bastaja (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-08-004, 4783 Olentangy Blvd., Old Beechwold Historic District, for renewal of expired COA # 17-6-13 (Expired: June 15, 2018), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Replace Existing Driveway

- Remove existing driveway and replace with new asphalt drive
- Relocate the drive to the south to align with garage
- Add 18'x20' turn around on the south side of the new driveway.
- All work to be as per submitted site plan.

MOTION: Henry/Clark (5-0-0) APPROVED

HR-19-08-005

2117 Iuka Avenue

Iuka Ravine Historic District

George Callif (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-08-005, 2117 Iuka Avenue, Iuka Ravine Historic District, for renewal of expired COA # 18-7-1 (Expired: June 20, 2019), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year. Repair Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements and wood siding on the frame garage, as needed. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim;</u> like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Replace any missing or damaged wood panels in the overhead garage door.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the garage for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Custom paint color to match existing house color "Terra Cotta" and "Dessert Sand."

HR-19-08-006

330 South High Street

Desi Varsel/Signs Unlimited, Inc. (Applicant)

South High Street Commercial Group Keith Atich (Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-08-006, 330 South High Street, South High Street Commercial, for renewal of expired COA # 19-2-9 (Expired: February 21, 2019), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year. Approve Application 19-2-9, 330 South High Street, S. High Street Commercial Group, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove Awning

• Remove the existing, blue fabric awning above the main entrance.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.</u>
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the frame house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color to be Dark Brown, Burnt Orange, and Arlon Olive Green.
- Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick piers, stone capitals and plinths) is to remain unpainted. New Projecting Sign
- Install one (1) new projecting sign, per the submitted rendering.
- New, non-illuminated, painted (Tan) aluminum sign cabinet to measure 48.00" W x 22.00" H x 3" D (total 7.33 sf).
- New sign to include business name, "Just Love Coffee Café," and logo. Vinyl letters/logo to be Dark Brown, Burnt Orange, and Olive Green, per the submitted rendering.
- Sign bracket to be mounted onto the wood fascia board above the main entrance.

New Wall Sign

- Install one (2) new wall signs, per the submitted rendering.
- New, painted PVC sign to be located in the sign band above the main entrance.
- Each sign to read "EAT. DRINK. LOVE."

MOTION: McCabe/Gibboney (5-0-0) APPROVED

HR-19-08-007

787-789 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Joseph Seifert (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-08-007, 787-789 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, for renewal of expired COA # 17-9-12 (Expired: September 11, 2018), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year. Repair Front Porch

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing T & G, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, T & G, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new, T & G wooden, porch flooring as needed.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; color to match the existing.
- Restore the front porch wooden privacy panels and all metal hand rails as necessary with like materials of exact same dimensions and profiles as the existing, original, front porch wooden privacy panels and metal hand rails; like-for-like.
- Repair and/or replace all twelve (12) deteriorated porch columns as necessary. Any/all new columns to match the existing, columns in dimension, style, and material exactly; like-for-like.
- Repair and/or replace existing, original metal 'iron bar' skirting as necessary an in accordance with industry and historic preservation standards; like-for-like.
- All exterior paint colors to match the existing paint color schedule; like-for-like.

Repair Porch Piers

- Remove any/all deteriorated and damaged material on the original stone piers on the front porch and replace with like-for-like stone piers.
- Any/all replacement stone is required to match the existing, original stone type, size, color, and shape exactly; like-for-like.
- Mortar to match existing mortar in color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (Refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings".) The height, thickness, and length of the parapet wall is to remain the same as the original following the completion of all repairs.

• HR-19-08-008

343 North Front Street

Ohio Moline Plow Building/Individual Listing

Nationwide Realty Investors (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-08-008, 343 North Front Street, Ohio Moline Plow Building/Individual Listing as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove Planters

• Remove any/all non-original, non-contributing, wood planters located on the exterior of the building, per the submitted photographs.

Door Transoms

- Remove any/all paint and/or signage from the transoms above the two (2) entrance doors on the south elevation.
- Remove any/all opaque material from the transoms.
- Install clear glass in the transoms, as needed.

HR-19-08-009

736 Bedford Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Fannie R. Nesbit (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-08-009, 736 Bedford Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove Slate and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all slate on the main roof of the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be Owens Corning (standard 3-tab), "Estate Gray."
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

HR-19-08-010

972 East Capital Street

18th & E. Broad Street Historic District

Broad Street Living, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-08-010, 972 East Capital Street, 18th & E. Broad Street Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Modify Previous Approval/New Construction

- Increase overall height of carriage house structure from 30' 5 3/32" to 32' 2 3/32".
- Add one (1) egress door on the north elevation.
- Reconfigure locations of all overhead and service doors, and windows on the north elevation. Reduce from nine (9) to eight (8) windows.
- Reconfigure locations of windows on the south elevation. Reduce from five (5) to four (4) windows.
- Install goose neck light fixtures above, or adjacent to, all overhead and service doors.
- East and west elevations of carriage house to remain as previously approved.
- Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

• HR-19-08-012

662 South Champion Avenue (aka 664 S. Champion Ave/rear) **Aaron McDaniel (Applicant)**

Old Oaks Historic District Redwood Investment Group, LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application HR-19-08-012, 662 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Basement Windows

- Remove all existing glass block in the foundation.
- Install new, 2 or 3-lite fixed, awning, or hopper style windows, to fit existing openings.
- New windows may be wood, fiberglass, or aluminum-clad wood.
- <u>Cut sheet for new windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to installation.</u>

Front & Rear Porch

- Retain original front porch, as is.
- Build new rear porch, per the submitted drawings.
- Porch to be painted within one (1) year.

X. OLD BUSINESS

- 734 S. Champion Avenue The "test case" fiberglass door (approved April 18, 2019/COA# 19-4-7) has been installed.
- XI. NEW BUSINESS
- XII. ADJOURN